Being a Change Agent in the Search Process

DRIVE Faculty Committee: Diversifying the Faculty and Administrators at Illinois
Objectives of this seminar

1. Familiarize you with tools and strategies for increasing the diversity of your pool
2. Point you to resources you can use to implement these strategies
3. Discuss the role of implicit bias in evaluation of applicants for faculty/dean positions
4. Review techniques to reduce bias in self and others
5. More in-depth than required online module for all search committee members
Why does diversity matter?

"…June [2014, was] the last school year ever in which a majority of America's K-12 public-school students [were] white."

"…as our society diversifies, broadening the circle of opportunity has become a matter not only of equity but also of competitiveness."

…minority young people are the nation's future workers, consumers, and taxpayers. If more of them don't obtain the education and training to reach the middle class, the U.S. "will be a poorer and less competitive society" (Rice University sociologist Steven Murdock)

Why does diversity matter?

Diversity benefits our teaching and research mission

- Diverse working groups more productive, creative, and innovative (e.g., Herring, 2009)
- Ideas generated by diverse groups of higher quality (McLeod et al., 1996)
- Level of critical analysis of decisions and alternatives higher in groups exposed to minority viewpoints (e.g., Sommers et al., 2006)
Diverse groups are more productive

From 2006 to August 2014 companies with 1 or more women on the board of directors have outperformed companies without women on the board by

18% in Europe
20% in the US
55% in Asia

Global performance: companies market cap >USD 10 billion

3000 companies in 40 countries, all sectors

Source: CSG 3000

University of Illinois system, Guiding Values include “Be inclusive, treat each other with dignity and respect, and promote citizenship”

https://www.uillinois.edu/about/mission/

The faculty senate has affirmed the importance of diversity as central to the university’s goals (see Campus Diversity Values Statement endorsed by the Faculty Senate)

Commitment to diversity can be across academic and campus life programs FOR STUDENTS e.g., Housing multicultural advocates, Office of Minority Student Affairs, Diversity and Social Justice programs, African American, Asian American Cultural Centers, La Casa Cultural Latina, LGBT resource center, Native American House, and many others
Tenure line faculty of color at Illinois

Assistant Professor:
- Non-URM: 83.86%
- URM: 16.14%

Associate Professor:
- Non-URM: 84.81%
- URM: 15.19%

Professor:
- Non-URM: 90.69%
- URM: 9.31%
Little change over time

Faculty: August 2012

- White: 68.63%
- Black: 24.93%
- Hispanic: 3.08%
- Asian: 0.28%
- American Indian: 2.24%
- Two or More: 0.28%
- International*: 2.80%

Faculty: August 2017

- White: 62.16%
- Black: 29.48%
- Hispanic: 4.42%
- Asian: 0.25%
- American Indian: 7.37%
- Two or More: 2.95%
- International*: 4.42%

*Faculty with visa status HB, TR, O1, J1, and F1
Women/Men tenure line faculty at Illinois

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Professor</td>
<td>43.03%</td>
<td>56.97%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Professor</td>
<td>41.41%</td>
<td>58.59%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor</td>
<td>25.18%</td>
<td>74.82%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Relatively little change over time

Faculty: August 2012
- Men: 87.39%
- Women: 12.61%

Faculty: August 2017
- Men: 82.31%
- Women: 17.69%
Lack of racial/ethnic diversity among US professoriate in general

Less Diversity at Higher Ranks of the Professoriate

More than four in five full professors are white. Among assistant professors, a smaller group over all (about 83,000 compared with 134,000 full professors), the proportions of black, Hispanic, and Asian scholars are somewhat higher.

- **FULL PROFESSOR**: 81.8% White, 18.2% Non-White*
- **ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR**: 75.3% White, 24.7% Non-White*
- **ASSISTANT PROFESSOR**: 64.8% White, 35.2% Non-White*

* Non-white includes Hispanic, Black, Asian, American Indian, Unknown, Pacific Islander and Nonresident alien and two or more races

Note: These figures, for 2013-14, represent full professors with tenure, associate professors with tenure, and assistant professors on the tenure track at degree-granting, Title IV-compliant, four-year public and private nonprofit institutions, categorized by the Carnegie Classification of Institutions of Higher Education as research, master’s, or baccalaureate, with at least 15 full-time staff members. The data set considers Hispanic and nonresident alien as racial/ethnic groups mutually exclusive of any other.

Source: Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System
Faculty with Endowed Appointments by Gender

The percentage of women with named faculty appointments at the university continues to be significantly lower than the overall percentage of female faculty members.
Women in Campus Leadership (2016)

- Chancellor’s Office: 42% Men, 58% Women
- Provost and Vice Chancellor’s Offices: 40% Men, 60% Women
- College Deans: 64% Men, 36% Women
- Department Head, Chair, Director: 69% Men, 31% Women
Underrepresentation of Women & Minorities

Why are minorities and women underrepresented at Illinois, and in academia more broadly?

- “Supply-side” or pipeline factors result in a smaller pool – often cited as main reason for lack of diversity in hiring

- However, “demand-side” factors such as implicit (unconscious) bias result in lower preferences for women and minority applicants who do make it into the pool

Demand-side Issues: Implicit Bias

Even if we have strong egalitarian values and believe we are not biased we may still behave in discriminatory ways (e.g., Dovidio, 2001)

Judgments shaped by:
- Biology of efficiency: the brain is designed to predict, fill in blanks
- A lifetime of experience and cultural history

Leads to implicit bias and stereotyping

Applies to a variety of physical and social characteristics associated with race, gender, age, & ethnicity—even height
When shown photographs of people of the same height, evaluators overestimated men’s heights and underestimated women’s heights, even though a reference point, such as a doorway, was provided (Manis, Biernat, & Nelson, 1991)

Decisions were based on assumptions about average height of men vs women despite evidence that the individual in question did not fit the stereotype.
Biases in the Search Process

Resumes of applicants with “white-sounding” and “male” names were more likely to be interviewed for open positions than were equally qualified applicants with “African-American-sounding” or “female” names (Bertand & Mullainathan, 2004; Steinpreis, Anders & Ritzke, 1999)

When rating the quality of verbal skills as indicated by vocabulary definitions, evaluators rated skills lower if told that an African American provided the definitions than if a White person provided them (Biernat & Manis, 1994). Similar findings regarding women considered for a manager position (Moss-Racusin et al., 2012).
A study of over 300 letters of recommendation for applicants to medical faculty positions found that letters written for women tended to:

- Be shorter
- Provide “minimal assurance” rather than solid recommendation
- Include more “doubt raisers” e.g., negative language, faint praise, irrelevancies
- Portray women as students and teachers while portraying men as researchers and professionals
- More frequently mention women’s personal lives
WHAT CAN YOU DO TO BE A CHANGE AGENT IN THE SEARCH PROCESS?

Advocate for Diversity
How to advocate for diversity:

Make sure all committee members know they should get familiar with the Academic Search Process website and review the Guidelines http://diversity.illinois.edu/academicsearch.html

Also see handouts, Diversity Advocate checklist, Search Chair checklist, etc
Strategies to increase diversity of the pool

Review databases for listings of diverse scholars and contact any that might fit the position description (see pg. 28 Search Manual)

- Diversifying Higher Education Faculty in Illinois (DFI) Program Directory
- The Registry (User Name: InclusiveIllinois Password: illinois1)
- CIC Doctoral Directory
- Southern Regional Education Board (SREB) (enter email address, diversity@illinois.edu and password SUB0114)

Work with HR staff to mail/email job postings to professional journals/associations, web recruitment boards, electronic newsletters, newsgroups that represent diversity, Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs) and other Minority Serving Institutions (MSIs)
Engage local and regional networks of people in related fields to see if they know of potential candidates.

Encourage colleagues who will be attending professional conferences to recruit for the position.

Contact women and minorities who have received significant grants or professional recognition and ask for the names of promising women and minority scholars.
Strategies to increase diversity of the pool

Maintain close contact with graduates of the U of I and encourage them to apply or to contact their colleagues.

Ask members of the department to call colleagues at other institutions to see if they know of underrepresented individuals who might be qualified for and interested in the position.
Track diversity of the applicant pool

Diversity of the applicant pool can be tracked at any time by contacting the Office of Diversity, Equity, and Access (ODEA) to request a list of TOP eligible candidates.

ODEA will automatically provide a report after the search has closed.

If the pool is insufficient the search may be extended.
Evaluators who were busy, distracted by other tasks, and under time pressure gave women lower ratings than men for the same written evaluation of job performance.

Gender bias decreases when evaluators are able to give more time and attention to their judgments.

(Edeaux & Emmswiller, 1974; Isaac, Lee, & Carnes, 2009)

Educating faculty, chairs, deans, and administrators that unconscious bias exists may be one of the most effective methods of reducing it.

(Stout, Staiger, & Jennings, 2007)
Role of a diversity advocate

Discuss, monitor, and point out biases if they emerge in the search process
Strategies to avoid bias

Ensure consistent evaluation of all applicants by spending sufficient time reviewing each applicant

Evaluate each candidate’s entire application

- Avoid depending too heavily on only one element such as letters of recommendation, or the prestige of the degree-granting institution or post-doctoral program
- Be able to defend every decision for eliminating or advancing a candidate through documentation of decisions

Ensure careful/fair treatment of all applicants at each stage of the selection process (review, interviews, discussion of finalists)
Question your judgments and decisions and consider whether unintentional bias may have played a role.

- Are women or minority applicants subject to higher expectations in areas such as number/quality of publications? Name recognition? Personal acquaintance with well-known colleagues?
- Are applicants who received degrees from institutions other than major research universities being considered? If not, why not?
- Are achievements/contributions attributed to collaborators despite evidence to the contrary in publications and letters?
Examples of “Short Cuts” that contribute to bias

- Negative Stereotypes
  - Presumptions of incompetence

- Positive Stereotypes
  - Presumptions of competence

- Snap Judgments
  - Judgments with insufficient evidence

- Cloning
  - Similar attributes/background

- Euphemized Bias
  - Visionary
  - Star
  - Committed
  - Focused

Source: Based on materials provided at Interrupting bias in the faculty search process. ADVANCE Center for Institutional Change.
Intentionally replace stereotypes (e.g., if girls are being portrayed as bad at math, identify this as a gender stereotype and replace it with accurate information)

Use positive counterstereotypic imaging (e.g., before evaluating job applicants for a position traditionally held by men, imagine in detail an effective woman leader or scientist)

Take your time to focus on specific information about an applicant to prevent group stereotypes from leading to potentially inaccurate assumptions

Create/take advantage opportunities for contact with counterstereotypic exemplars (e.g., meet with senior women faculty to discuss their ideas and vision)
What else can a diversity advocate do?

Communicate that diversity is valued in the job announcement and at institutional level.

Learn more about your own unconscious biases (e.g., take the Implicit Attitudes Test), and encourage other faculty to learn about implicit bias.

Always be recruiting!
Diversity “Taxes”

Assumptions, stereotypes, implicit biases
Isolation
Excessive demands and assignments
Inadequate mentoring
Less extensive informational networks
Alienation and lack of recognition
Issues of modesty and self-promotion

Leads to cumulative professional disadvantage

From “Creating change from the middle”, Joan Reede, Presentation at the American Public Health Association, 2015 https://apha.confex.com/apha/143am/webprogram/Paper338142.html
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Department/Field</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Matthew Ando</td>
<td>Mathematics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tami Bond</td>
<td>Civil and Environmental Engineering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ollie Watts Davis</td>
<td>Music</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicki Jene Engeseth</td>
<td>Food Chemistry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris Green</td>
<td>Recreation, Sport and Tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matthias Grosse Perdekamp</td>
<td>Physics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wendy Heller</td>
<td>Psychology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aric Rindfleisch</td>
<td>Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jamelle Sharpe</td>
<td>Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linda Smith</td>
<td>Library and Information Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heidi Johnson</td>
<td>Director of ODEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assata Zerai</td>
<td>Associate Chancellor for Diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>With assistance from Medra Roberts-Southerland</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Special appreciation to WISELI: Women in Science & Engineering Leadership Institute, University of Wisconsin

- This presentation drew upon brochures prepared by Eve Fine and Jo Handelsman
- Benefits and Challenges of Diversity in Academic Settings
- Reviewing Applicants: Research on Bias and Assumptions

And to the ADVANCE Center for Institutional Change, University of Washington for slides/resources

See handout for full references to publications cited in this presentation

Visit DRIVE for these and additional resources/articles
Acknowledgements

The University of Illinois Office of Diversity, Equity and Access (ODEA), Associate Chancellor for Diversity Assata Zerai, Prof. Wendy Heller, chair and members of the DRIVE committee

Visit DRIVE on the ODEA website and Illinois Box https://uofi.box.com/s/lf3q4uqsfme771c9vxfod70hu0jlv41 for additional resources
Contact Information

Diversity Realized at Illinois through Visioning Future Excellence (DRIVE)
Website: www.diversity.illinois.edu/DRIVE.html

Office of Diversity, Equity, and Access (ODEA)
Phone: 217.333.0885
Fax: 217.244.9136
Email: diversity@illinois.edu
Website: www.diversity.illinois.edu
Deliberations of a Search Committee

- [Video: Interrupting Bias](#) (password bias355!)

*Source: Based on materials provided at Interrupting bias in the faculty search process, ADVANCE Center for Institutional Change*